TEAMS WEBINAR RUBRIC: INSTRUCTIONS

Dr. Michael J. Culbertson,[1] RMC Research Corporation
Dr. Emma V. Espel, RMC Research Corporation
Vicki LaRock, RMC Research Corporation
Dr. John T. Sutton, RMC Research Corporation
Dr. Xin Wang, RMC Research Corporation
Brandie Ward, RMC Research Corporation
Amanda Withington, RMC Research Corporation

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The Technical Evaluation Assistance in Mathematics and Science (TEAMS) project (DRL#1238120) is funded under the National Science Foundation (NSF) Mathematics and Science Partnership (MSP) Research Evaluation and Technical Assistance (RETA) program. TEAMS began operations in May 2013 with the specific goal to: *Strengthen the quality of MSP project evaluation and build the capacity of evaluators by strengthening their skills related to evaluation design, methodology, analysis, and reporting.* Any opinions, suggestions, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this paper are those of the TEAMS project and do not necessarily reflect the views of the NSF; NSF has not approved or endorsed its content.

INSTRUCTIONS

The TEAMS Webinar Rubric is intended for use by project staff and evaluators (both internal and external) of Mathematics and Science Partnership projects funded by the National Science Foundation and the U.S. Department of Education. This rubric focuses on how the various components of the webinar support and enhance participant engagement and is organized around 7 key webinar components: Recruitment, Technology, Content, Organization, Delivery, Visual Aids, and Participant Interaction.

Each section includes a set of indicators of webinar quality (text in boxes that extend across the whole page) that may be rated on a 5-point scale: None, Minimal, Developing, Strong, and Exemplary. To assist in rating, the scale for each indicator has been illustrated with a brief description of webinar quality at each scale point (text in the set of 5 boxes beneath each indicator). Some features in the scale descriptions may not be applicable to every webinar. The scale descriptions are intended primarily as

---

examples of the range of quality for the given indicator, not as prescriptive requirements for every webinar.

After rating each indicator, take the average of the indicator scores in each section to obtain 7 webinar component scores. The component scores may be reported together to provide a multidimensional assessment of webinar quality. To obtain an overall score, average the 7 component scores.

The rubric is accompanied by a complete user's guide with additional details regarding how the rubric was crafted and examples of how the areas and key features can be seen in actual webinars. The user's guide also includes a set of features to consider when planning a webinar, as well as a set of reflection questions for webinar organizers and presenters to use in self-assessment after the webinar.

REFERENCES

Badia, G. & Colosimo, A. (2013). *Best Practices for Engaging Users in a Web Conferencing Environment.* Paper ID#6907. Atlanta, GA: American Society for Engineering Education – 120th ASEE Annual Conference and Exposition.

Communiqué Conferencing, Inc (2003). *Conducting a Webinar: A step-by-step to planning and executing a Webinar.* Retrieved from http://www.communiqueconferencing.com/webseminarwhitepaper.pdf.

Fripp, P. (2009). 15 tips for Webinars: How to add impact when you present online. *eLearn Magazine.* Retrieved from http://elearnmag.acm.org/featured.cfm?aid=1595445.

Guanci, G. (2010). Best Practices for Webinars. *Ingentaconnect: Creative Nursing, Volume 16, Number 3, 2010, pp. 119-121(3)*. Springer Publishing Company. Retrieved from http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/springer/crnu/2010/00000016/00000003/art00006.

Lande, L. (2011). Webinar Best Practices: From Invitation to Evaluation. Stout, WI: University of Wisconsin. Retrieved from http://www2.uwstout.edu/content/lib/thesis/2011/2011landel.pdf.

Lee, T. (2010). *Webinar 101*. Retrieved from http://timothyleear.blogspot.com/p/webinar-101.html.

Mitchell, O. (2010). *18 Tips on how to conduct an engaging webinar.* Retrieved from http://www.speakingaboutpresenting.com/presentation-skills/how-to-conduct-engaging-webinar/

Molay, K. *Best practices for webinars: increasing attendance, engaging your audience, and successfully advancing your business goals*. White Paper 2009 [cited 2013 January 7]; Available from: http://www.adobe.com/products/acrobatconnectpro/webconferencing/pdfs/Best_Practices_for_Webinars_v4_FINAL.pdf.

Yates, J. (2014) Synchronous online CPD: empirical support for the value of webinars in career settings, *Researchgate: British Journal of Guidance & Counselling, 42:3, 245-260*. Retrieved from http://www.researchgate.net/publication/260281922_Synchronous_online_CPD_Empirical_support_for_the_value_of_webinars_in_career_settings.

Wang, S. & Hsu, H. (2008). Use of the Webinar Tool (Elluminate) to Support Training: The Effects of Webinar-Learning Implementation from Student-Trainers' Perspective. *Journal of Interactive Online Learning, Volume 7, Number 3, Winter 2008*. Retrieved from http://www.ncolr.org/jiol/issues/pdf/7.3.2.pdf

TEAMS Webinar Rubric

Recruitment

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Audience – The webinar is advertised to an appropriate audience. Examples: If the target audience is teachers, appropriate email listservs, Facebook groups, and school websites are used to advertise the webinar to those teachers.				
The webinar is not advertised.	The invitation does not reach an appropriate audience, and the target audience is unclear.	The invitation reaches an appropriate audience, but the webinar is also widely advertised to irrelevant groups. The target audience is unclear.	The webinar has a clear target audience, but recruitment efforts do not fully cover the target audience.	The webinar has a clear target audience, and recruitment efforts specifically target the intended audience.
Advertisement – The webinar is advertised sufficiently in advance and on multiple occasions.				
The webinar is not advertised.	The first invitation or announcement is sent/posted less than two weeks prior to the webinar. The webinar is only advertised once.	The first invitation or announcement is sent/posted at least two weeks prior to the webinar. The webinar is only advertised once.	The first invitation or announcement is sent/posted at least two weeks prior to the webinar. The webinar is advertised more than once.	The first invitation or announcement is sent/ posted at least one month prior to the webinar. It is advertised multiple times and through multiple media (e.g., website, email, newsletters, social media).
Invitation Content – The invitation provides complete and accurate information about the content of the webinar.				
No webinar invitation is provided.	The webinar invitation provides information about when the webinar will occur but does not provide information about who is presenting, what content the webinar will cover, or how to register for the webinar.	The webinar invitation provides some basic information about when the webinar will occur, who is presenting, what content the webinar will cover, and/or how to register for the webinar.	The invitation provides partial information about who is presenting, what content the webinar will cover, and when the webinar will occur, but the information is not substantive. The invitation provides instructions for registering for or accessing the webinar.	The invitation provides complete and accurate information about who is presenting (including a short bio and/or a photo), what content the webinar will cover, and when the webinar will occur. The invitation provides instructions for registering for or accessing the webinar.

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Invitation Format – The webinar invitation is easy to read, stylistically appropriate, and visually engaging.				
No invitation is provided.	The webinar invitation contains some typos and/or errors. Formatting to make the invitation easy to read or engaging is not used.	The webinar invitation is free of typos and errors. Formatting to make the invitation easy to read or engaging is not used.	The webinar invitation is free of typos and errors. Bolding, subheadings, and/or bullets may be used, but they do not consistently highlight key messages.	The webinar invitation is free of typos and errors. Bolding, subheadings, and/or bullets are used to highlight key messages. The invitation is easy to read and visually engaging.
Invitation Format – The webinar invitation is easy to read, stylistically appropriate, and visually engaging.				
No registration information is provided.	Webinar registration information provided in webinar advertisements (e.g., website, email invitations), is incomplete or unclear and/or completing the online registration presents technology challenges.	Webinar registration information provided is complete, easy to follow and there are no glitches with the online registration process.	Webinar registration information provided is accurate and complete. The online registration process is user-friendly and absent of any technology problems. Registrants receive a confirmation email after they complete the registration form.	Complete webinar registration information is provided in the invitation email. The registration/ sign-up process is clear, concise and user friendly. Registrants receive a confirmation email after they complete the registration form. The confirmation email includes the link to the webinar and may include an Outlook calendar invite. The registration site provides information about when the webinar will occur, who is presenting, and what content the webinar will cover.

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Registration – The registration process provides participants with complete and accurate information about how to access the webinar. Examples: The invitation directs potential participants to a website where they enter their contact information, and participants receive a confirmation email with a link to the webinar. Participants email a coordinator to signal their intent to participate. For open webinars with no preregistration, advertisements contain all necessary information to access the webinar.				
No registration information is provided.	Webinar registration information provided in webinar advertisements (e.g., website, email invitations), is incomplete or unclear and/or completing the online registration presents technology challenges.	Webinar registration information provided is complete, easy to follow and there are no glitches with the online registration process.	Webinar registration information provided is accurate and complete. The online registration process is user-friendly and absent of any technology problems. Registrants receive a confirmation email after they complete the registration form.	Complete webinar registration information is provided in the invitation email. The registration/sign-up process is clear, concise and user friendly. Registrants receive a confirmation email after they complete the registration form. The confirmation email includes the link to the webinar and may include an Outlook calendar invite. The registration site provides information about when the webinar will occur, who is presenting, and what content the webinar will cover.

Technology

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Tools – Presenters provide an overview of the technology platform being used for the webinar prior to or at the beginning of the webinar. Examples: At the start of the webinar, presenters explain the chat box function and how to select the audience for a comment/question. At the start of the webinar or before a specific poll/activity, presenters explain how to use specific response features (e.g., raising a hand, clicking into the poll).				
The presenters do not provide any information about the technology platform and available features that is being used in the webinar.	The presenters only provide information regarding the technology platform and available features as participants ask questions about them during the webinar.	The presenters provide an overview of some of the available features but not all. Participants still may be asking how to submit questions, provide responses, and/or use other platform features during the presentation.	The presenters provide an overview of most of the available features but not all. Participants still may be asking questions during the presentation about using platform features that have not been sufficiently explained.	The presenters provide an overview of all necessary features of the webinar platform that allow participants to actively engage in the webinar. Few participants are asking questions about specific features of the webinar platform during the presentation.
Distractions – The webinar is free of distractions. Examples: Distractions include things like pop-up computer notifications, cell phones ringing, people/pets coming in and out, presenters not knowing how to use the software, or presenters being positioned directly in front of a light or a distracting background/picture.				
The webinar cannot be completed due to technology errors.	There are a number of substantial distractions throughout the webinar that impede the flow of the webinar.	There are some distractions during the webinar, but the flow of the presentation is not constantly interrupted.	There are a few minor distractions during the webinar that are barely noticeable.	There are no distractions during the webinar.
Supplemental Materials – Clear instructions are provided to participants on how to access the archived webinar recording and other supplemental materials. Examples: Participants are informed that the webinar will be recorded and given the information to access the archived webinar video and presentation slides. Links to supplemental materials, such as handouts or other resources, and presenters' contact information are included in presentation slides.				
No instructions are provided on how to access the webinar recording, slides, or supplemental materials.	Instructions for accessing the webinar recording and slides are unclear and/or incomplete. Supplemental materials are incidentally mentioned, but they are not actually made available. Or materials are made available, but participants are not notified.	Instructions for accessing the webinar recording and slides are available and accurate. Participants are made aware of the supplemental materials, but instructions for accessing them are unclear.	Clear and explicit instructions are provided for how to access the webinar recording, slides, and supplemental materials after the presentation is complete.	Clear and explicit instructions are provided for how to access the webinar recording and/or slides at the end of the presentation. Additionally, written instructions are provided in follow-up communication with participants.

Content

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Presenter Information – Presenters are introduced and their backgrounds, including credentials relative to the webinar topic, are provided prior to and/or at the beginning of the webinar.				
Examples: Information about presenters and their professional affiliations is provided in the webinar invitation or description, and presenters are introduced using bio or background information before their presentations begin.				
The presenters are not introduced and their credentials and backgrounds are not provided.	The presenters are introduced during the webinar but their credentials and backgrounds are not provided.	The presenters are introduced and their credentials are provided during or prior to the webinar, but the relevance of the presenters' expertise to the webinar content is not clear.	The presenters are introduced and their credentials are provided. Some of their credentials directly relate to the topic of the webinar.	The presenters are introduced and introductions include how their backgrounds and credentials qualify them to speak knowledgeably about the webinar topic.
Goals – The topic and objectives or goals of the webinar are clearly communicated to the audience.				
Examples: The topic(s) and objectives are provided in the webinar description or invitation email and the content and what the audience is expected to learn are stated at the beginning of the webinar.				
The topic and objectives/goals are not communicated with the audience prior to or during the webinar.	The topic and objectives/goals of the webinar are briefly stated prior to or at the beginning of the webinar, but it is not clear how the webinar's topic is related to the objectives/goals.	The topic and objectives/goals of the webinar are clearly stated prior to or during the webinar. The webinar's topic appears to be related to the objectives/goals, but the connection may be implicit.	The webinar's topic and objectives/goals are clearly stated and referenced throughout the webinar.	The webinar's topic and objectives/goals are clearly stated and referenced throughout the webinar, and explicit connections are made between the webinar's topic and its objectives/goals.
On Task – The webinar content matches the stated goals or objectives.				
There are no clear and explicit objectives/goals for the webinar.	The webinar content does not match the stated goals.	The webinar content aligns with some of the stated goals or objectives.	The webinar content aligns with most of the stated goals or objectives.	The webinar content clearly aligns with all the stated goals or objectives.

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Relevance – The webinar promotes learning a new task, skill, or content that is relevant to the audience's real-world problems.				
The webinar does not teach a new task, skill, or content.	The webinar teaches a new task, skill, or content. However, the new learning is not relevant to the target audience.	The webinar teaches a new task, skill, or content that is somewhat relevant to the target audience.	The webinar teaches a new task, skill, or content that is relevant to the target audience. However, the connection between the new learning and solving real-life problems is not explicit.	The webinar uses multiple real world problems and examples that contextualize the new task, skill, or content throughout the webinar. All examples and problems are relevant to the webinar topic and its target audience.

Organization

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Direction – The webinar introduction includes an outline or agenda.				
No webinar outline or agenda is provided.	An outline or agenda is displayed briefly without comment.	The presenters read the outline or agenda at the beginning of the webinar.	The presenters introduce the outline or agenda at the beginning of the webinar and explain how the webinar's components fit together.	An outline or agenda is presented and discussed at the beginning of the webinar, and revisited during transitions and at its conclusion.
Outline Accuracy – The webinar outline or agenda reflects the webinar's structure and content.				
No outline or agenda is provided, or the webinar outline or agenda does not accurately reflect the webinar's structure and content.	The webinar outline or agenda minimally reflects the webinar's structure and content.	The webinar outline or agenda partially reflects the webinar's structure and content.	The webinar outline or agenda accurately reflects the webinar's structure. However, it does not provide clear expectations of the content to be covered.	The webinar outline or agenda accurately reflects the webinar's structure and provides clear expectations of the content to be covered.

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Information Chunking – Webinar information is presented in small segments.				
None of the webinar information is presented in small segments.	Some portions of the webinar are presented in segments, but the segments are lengthy.	Some portions of the webinar are presented in small segments. Other information is presented in lengthy segments.	Most portions of the webinar are presented in small segments.	All webinar information is organized into and presented in small segments.
Structure – The webinar presentation is well-organized.				
Webinar information is not presented in a logical, easy-to-follow sequence.	Webinar information is presented in a logical sequence, but it is difficult to follow. No transitions are used to make connections between sections.	Webinar information is presented in a logical, easy-to-follow sequence. Some effort is made to use transitions to provide connections between sections, but the transitions are minimal.	Webinar information is presented in a logical, easy-to-follow sequence. Some explicit connections between sections are made using transition statements, graphic organizers, relational phrases, or other techniques.	Webinar information is presented in a logical, easy-to-follow sequence. Presenters make explicit connections between all sections using transitional statements, graphic organizers, relational phrases, or other techniques.

Delivery

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Variety – The webinar shifts between presentation modes regularly throughout the webinar.				
Examples: Shifts in presentation mode include moving from lecture to discussion, switching speakers, alternating between receptive and interactive activities, changing visual layouts, modulation of tone, etc.				
The webinar uses only one presentation mode.	The webinar primarily uses one presentation mode, with some token usage of other modes.	The webinar alternates between two presentation modes, but shifts between presentation modes occur infrequently.	The webinar alternates between several presentation modes, but shifts between presentation modes occur infrequently.	The webinar incorporates a variety of presentation modes and changes presentation modes at least every 10 minutes.

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Reflection – The webinar provides time for participants to absorb a new idea or key information before moving on to the next new idea.					
Examples: Time to absorb an idea is provided by including pauses, additional examples, connections to other ideas or real-world experiences, opportunities to apply the idea to practice, reflection questions, discussions, summaries of what has been covered, etc.				
New ideas are introduced one after the other with little time in between.	The webinar includes a few opportunities for participants to absorb new ideas, but most ideas are presented one after the other with little time in between.	The webinar includes pauses after each major section of content, but new ideas within sections are introduced one after the other with little time in between.	The webinar provides an opportunity to absorb each new idea before moving on to the next.	The webinar provides opportunities to absorb each new idea before moving on to the next that are made explicit and/or directly guided by the presenter.
Transitions – The transitions throughout the webinar are smooth with minimal delays.				
Examples: Transitions include changing speakers, moving to new topics, switching between communication tools (e.g., from slides to a poll). Transitions are not smooth when there are lengthy pauses or silences during the transition, presenters are not sure of who or what is coming next, presenters fumble with software controls, the technology does not load or respond promptly, etc.				
No clearly marked transitions occur during the webinar.	Transitions result in substantial delays and challenges.	Many transitions result in delays.	A few transitions result in some minor delays.	All transitions take place without delays.

Visual Aids

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Purpose – Slides are used to emphasize presenters' main points, not as a script to be read from directly.				
All slides are full of text and read word-for-word during the webinar without additional elaboration.	All slides are full of text and read word-for-word during the webinar with little elaboration added.	Most slides are full of text and read word-for-word during the webinar with some elaboration added.	Most slides are text heavy but not read word-for-word during the webinar.	Slide text is reserved for key words and concepts. Details and explanations are delivered verbally or through the use of supplemental materials.

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Readability – Visuals, including slides and graphic elements, can be ready easily on a computer screen.				
Examples: Slides contain a minimal amount of text. Text makes use of a small number of simple fonts. Text, including text within figures, tables, graphs, and charts, is large enough to read easily. Images are in focus and in high resolution so that they are not blurry or grainy. Slides contain a limited number of colors that provide high contrast.				
All visuals, including text and images, are difficult to read.	The majority of slides are difficult to read.	Most slides are clear, but there are some visuals that are difficult to read.	All visuals, including text and images, are easy to read.	All visuals, including text and images, are easy to read. A limited number of fonts in high-contrast colors, are used throughout to achieve readability and visual consistency.
Scaffolding Information – Presenters scaffold information by presenting visual aids, including text and images, one component at a time.				
Examples: Presenters reveal large sections of text one point at a time so each point scaffolds information from the previous point. If a complex diagram or a graphic containing multiple elements is discussed, each element is revealed as it is discussed, or attention is directed to each element individually and sequentially by using arrows, highlighting, a pointer, etc.				
There is no use of scaffolding. All slides reveal all components of text or graphics at once.	Very few slides reveal components of text or graphics in small segments. There are many missed opportunities for scaffolding learning by presenting ideas one at a time.	Many of the slides reveal components of text or graphics in small segments, but several contain missed opportunities for scaffolding learning by presenting ideas one at a time.	Most slides reveal components of text or graphics in small segments, though there are a few missed opportunities for scaffolding learning by presenting ideas one at a time.	One main idea is presented or revealed at a time within each slide. Components of text or graphics are revealed in small segments or one at a time.
Visual Relevance – Visuals (pictures, charts, tables, graphics, etc.) are clearly related to the topic.				
None of the visuals are obviously relevant to the webinar topic or the information presented on the slide.	Few visuals are clearly or obviously related to the webinar topic or information contained in the slide.	Some of the visuals are clearly or obviously related to the webinar topic or information contained on the slide.	Most of the visuals, but not all, are relevant to the topic or information presented on the slide.	All visuals are highly relevant to the webinar topic or information presented on the slide.

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Visual Variety – A variety of visuals are used during the webinar to enhance cognitive processing and maintain audience focus. Examples: Visuals include simple illustrations, charts, tables, graphs, photos, diagrams, etc.				
No visuals, other than text, are used during the webinar.	Visual elements other than text are rarely incorporated in the webinar.	Visual elements other than text are incorporated throughout the webinar, but primarily represent only one type.	Visual elements of several different types are used occasionally during the webinar.	Visual elements representing a variety of different types are used throughout the webinar.

Participant Interaction

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Active Learning Approaches – The webinar includes the use of active learning approaches and/or interactive activities. Examples: Active learning approaches include demonstrations, simulations, scenarios, games, and questioning. Interactive activities include polling, active questioning, collective wondering, discussions, and co-creation of objects or products.				
The webinar does not include any active learning approaches or interactive activities.	The webinar includes active learning approaches or interactive activities in a superficial way.	The webinar includes some meaningful opportunities for active learning or interactive activities but does not promote audience reflection or application of a new task, skill, or content.	The webinar includes some meaningful opportunities for active learning or interactive activities, and the presenters promote audience reflection or application of a new task, skill, or content.	A variety of active learning approaches and interactive activities are included throughout the webinar, and the presenters promote audience reflection or application of a new task, skill, or content.

None (0)	Minimal (1)	Developing (2)	Strong (3)	Exemplary (4)
Expectation of Participation – Presenters clearly communicate participation expectations, including expectations for active or passive participation. Example: Presenters directly ask the audience to use a webinar platform function to answer questions when the expectation is active, synchronous participation. When posing questions participants are to reflect on internally, presenters provide appropriate prompts to communicate that expectation.				
Presenters do not address expectations for passive or active participation from the audience.	Presenters make a general announcement regarding expectations for participation at the beginning of the webinar but do not reinforce this expectation at any other time during the webinar.	Presenters make a general announcement regarding expectations for participation at the beginning of the webinar and reinforce this expectation during a few opportunities within the webinar.	Presenters make a general announcement regarding expectations for participation at the beginning of the webinar and reinforce this expectation during most opportunities within the webinar.	Presenters clearly communicate the overall expectations for passive and/or audience participation and reinforce expectations at each opportunity throughout the webinar.
Questions – There is opportunity for participants to pose questions throughout the webinar. Example: Participants can submit questions through a chat box or other platform function like raising a hand to ask a question verbally. Presenters pause periodically to solicit and answer questions.				
There are no opportunities for participants to pose questions at any point during the webinar.	There is an opportunity for participants to pose questions near or at the end of the webinar. However, there is no time to address any of the questions.	There is an opportunity for participants to pose questions near or at the end of the webinar, and there is a sufficient amount of time to address one or more of the questions.	There are several opportunities throughout the webinar for participants to pose questions, but few opportunities include sufficient time to address questions.	There are several opportunities throughout the webinar for participants to pose questions, and most opportunities have sufficient time to address questions.